

**School of Technology**

**Council of the School**

**2.00 p.m. on Friday, 12 May 2017**

**The Board Room, Engineering**

**UNRESERVED MINUTES**

Present: Professor Richard Prager (Chairman)  
Professor David Cardwell  
Professor John Dennis  
Professor Christoph Loch  
Dame Polly Courtice  
Professor Lisa Hall  
Professor Ross Anderson  
Dr Alice Hutchings  
Professor Peter Robinson  
Professor Gishan Dissanaiké  
Professor Stewart Cant  
Professor Sir Mark Welland  
Professor Robin Langley  
Dr Tim Minshall  
Professor Bill Byrne  
Ms Alexa Belsham (Undergraduate Student Representative)  
Dr James Moultrie (School observer)  
Dr Claire Barlow (School observer)  
Dr Shui Lam (Secretary)  
Mr Matt Burgess (School Finance Manager)  
Ms Rachael Tuley (Assistant Secretary)  
Ms Yi-Jun Lin (Administrative Secretary)

In Attendance: Ms Tracy Brooks and Mrs Georgina Cannon throughout, and Mrs Sarah Botcherby for item 3.2 only

Apologies: Professor Andy Hopper, Professor Simon Guest, Mr Erwan Rolland (Graduate Student Representative), Professor Mark Blamire (School observer), Professor Richard Penty (School observer), and Dr Mark Thompson (School observer)

**Declarations of interest**

There was no declarations of conflict of interest.

## **1. Minutes**

The unreserved minutes of the meeting held on 3 February 2017 were approved. The note of the cancelled meeting scheduled to be held on 10 March 2017 was attached for information (Paper **T/17/19**).

### **Matters arising**

On 23 March 2017 the CISL Management Board agreed to recommend the proposal to set up a subsidiary company in Belgium in addition to the UK subsidiary company that was approved by the Needs Committee on behalf of the Council of the School on 30 June 2015. The papers provide more detail on the proposal: Paper **T/17/20** gives an update on the UK subsidiary (CSL), Paper **T/17/21** on the Belgium subsidiary and Paper **T/17/22** is a draft paper to the Finance Committee. The tax office and Legal Services have been fully involved in coming up with the proposal.

On 29 March 2017, the Council of the School of Technology approved for its part, by circulation, the recommendation from the CISL Management Board and the papers (**T/17/20**, **T/17/21**, **T/17/22**) were submitted to the Finance Committee's Business Committee which approved the recommendation from the Council of the School on 24 March 2017.

### **Chair's report**

There was no Chair's report.

## **2. Starred items**

The starred items were approved.

## **3. Principal business**

### **3.1. Nanjing Joint Venture**

At the meeting, it was reported that the General Board has established a Scrutiny Group to oversee the setting up of a joint venture in China between the Nanjing Municipal People's Government and the University. It was noted that the Legal Services Office has been fully involved in the drafting of the Heads of Terms (Paper **T/17/23**).

At the meeting, Professor Welland reported that the Heads of Terms had been signed the previous week in China and the next phase would be to prepare the relevant contracts for the University, under the oversight of the central Scrutiny Group. The following points emerged from the discussion:

1. Academic involvement is time-limited and no academic will be employed directly by the Joint Venture in China (and thus, not excluding any Cambridge academic from the next REF)

2. The £10m donation to establish one Professorship and two ULs in the Department of Engineering, will be an up-front donation to the University
3. A building of 6,000m<sup>2</sup> will be built in Nanjing, China to house research and development work
4. There will be research funding of RMB 300m for research projects to be undertaken by the Joint Venture Vehicle in China over 5 years: five projects spanning electrical engineering, civil engineering and manufacturing have been identified and it is hoped that they will be widened to the whole University and certainly to the whole of the School of Technology
5. It is likely that Professor Welland will direct the Centre for the first year and the academic directorship will then pass to the new Professor, who will spend approximately one month a year in China.
6. As for Cambridge CARES in Singapore, the staff working in China (academic staff as well as the local post-doctoral staff and administrative/technical staff) to be subject to the local health and safety regulations which will be designed to be consistent with standards set by the University.

In addition, the following points were noted:

7. 15% of the Joint Venture research funding to come to Cambridge for research (with the condition of an exclusive IP licence being granted to the Joint Venture Vehicle)
8. An annual management fee of £640k will be paid to Cambridge for the costs of participating in the proposal.

Based on past experience, the Council of the School noted that there are likely to be a number of queries to be addressed in the fullness of time, including whether or not the research projects (mentioned in point 7) will be costed at 100% FEC and the split of the management fee (point 8) between the centre and the Department.

The Council of the School approved the proposal in principle and looked forward to receiving further information as the joint venture develops.

### **3.2. Academic Career Paths**

At the meeting, it was reported that the Pro-Vice-Chancellor for Institutional and International Relations, Professor Ferran, has written to consult the Schools and the Departments on the proposal for academic career paths (Paper **T/17/24**), with a deadline of 2 June 2017. The Council of the School was invited to have a preliminary discussion at the meeting.

Mrs Sarah Botcherby attended the meeting to introduce the proposal and to answer questions. She stated that the working group was set up to propose new academic career paths, to replace the current senior academic promotion and probation system. The proposal will recognise excellence in teaching and leadership at professorial level by introducing three career strands: academic, research and teaching. In addition, the administrative process will be more streamlined.

Members of the Council of the School considered the proposal and raised a number of issues:

1. There was concern that the proposal recommends removing the faculty promotion committees, in attempting to streamline the administrative process. Heads of Department warned that this would mean there would not be sufficient local knowledge and expertise at any of the committees, to consider the applications in detail, making the system less robust.
2. One member strongly defended the current system, whereby an independent chair of the faculty promotion committee (i.e. not a Head of Department) is appointed, so as to avoid situations where particular applicants find their promotions blocked, as a consequence of poor relations with the department Head.
3. From the student perspective, recognition of teaching excellence was welcomed, since this is the most important aspect as far as undergraduate students are concerned.
4. There were concerns that the proposed system could codify “no need to teach” since it is possible to have zero weight for teaching in the research career strand.
5. A Head of Department commented that it was extremely dangerous to introduce flexibility in varying weights of different types of contributions, because every academic application should be treated equally and fairly. It might be better to establish a separate teaching track.
6. It was suggested that Professors promoted through teaching or research could have different respective titles, rather than just one title of professor.
7. Another Head commented that it was relatively easy to assess research, but judging teaching and general contribution is extremely difficult.
8. It is accepted that the current system of limiting promotion opportunities as a consequence of financial constraints, is discouraging to unsuccessful applicants. However, removing the financial constraint may not be sustainable and may lower the quality standard.

In addition, it was suggested that the system of Professorial Pay should be reviewed.

The Council of the School was requested to send any further comments to the Secretary by 19 May 2017. The School’s HR Committee will consider both the minutes of the Council of the School and any additional written comments at the meeting on 23 May 2017, with a view to making a School submission to the working group, by the deadline of 2 June 2017.

#### **4. Other Substantial business**

##### **4.1. MSt in Entrepreneurship**

At the meeting on 28 April 2017, the Graduate School Committee considered and approved a proposal to establish a MSt in Entrepreneurship from the Judge

Business School. The course will be a two-year part-time Masters degree with a total fee of around £31,000 over two years.

Since the meeting, a slightly revised version of the application document (Paper **T/17/25 Rev 1**) has been produced to address some minor issues raised by Student Registry, and which has been approved by the Graduate School Committee by circulation.

At the meeting, the Council of the School endorsed the recommendation from the Graduate School committee and, for its part, approved the proposal.

#### **4.2. National Productivity Investment Fund and EPSRC**

The EPSRC has informed the University that there will be an allocation of 35 additional PhD studentships with the condition that the studentships must start in October 2017 and all studentships should be four years in duration (Paper **T/17/26**).

At the meeting, the Director of Graduate Education, Dr Moultrie, reported on discussions with the School of the Physical Sciences on how to allocate the additional studentships between the two Schools:

- 12 industrial CASE, awaiting further information from industrial partners
- 13 DTP studentships, 7 would be allocated to Physical Sciences and 6 to Technology
- 10 CDT studentships, 2 to each of the following CDTs: Graphene, FIBE, Sensors, Gas Turbines and Nanotechnology.

#### **4.3. General Board Away Day on Graduate Education**

At the meeting, the Director of Graduate Education presented some short, medium and long term aspirations on graduate education to the Council of the School. This presentation would be given by the Head of School on the General Board Away Day.

#### **4.4. Report to the Undergraduate Admissions Committee, 2017**

The Council of the School approved the report (Paper **T/17/27**) produced by the Chair of the School Undergraduate Education Committee to the Undergraduate Admissions Committee, subject to a minor change.

#### **4.5. New Allocations and Savings for 2017-18**

Paper **T/17/28** is an extract from RMC papers considering 2017-18 supplementary allocations.

RMC agreed to make the following recurrent supplementary awards to the School from 2017-18:

- RDM Allocation: £225k
- MPhil Biotechnology (from 2018-19): £130k

Paper **T/17/29** suggests approaches for apportioning new awards across departments in 2017/18. The Council of the School approved the following allocations:

	<b>2017-18</b>
	<b>£k</b>
ENG	196
CEB	27
COMP LAB	35
JBS	(33)
<b>TOTAL Chest</b>	<b>225</b>

A strong objection was raised by Professor Loch, Director of JBS, relating to the School's RAM position for 2015-16, on which the £225k RDM allocation was based. The University's RAM TRAC Group agreed to change the apportionment basis for College Graduate Fees in the 2015-16 RAM (and thereafter), so that departments are charged based on the calculated college portion of the PG fee under the revised college fee agreement (25% subject to a cap), instead of an average per student FTE basis. This change particularly impacts on JBS, because its executive courses charge high fees. As a consequence JBS' college graduate fee costs have increased by approx. £700k in 2015-16, leading to a JBS RAM deficit of a similar amount. Professor Loch's principal objection arose because this change was introduced retrospectively, in 2016-17, allowing no time for the Department to adapt in-year to the new arrangements. The School raised an objection at a recent meeting of the RAM TRAC Group and secured a concession that transitional arrangements would be put in place (exact details still to be agreed) from 2016-17, in recognition of the retrospective nature of the decision. The 2015-16 RAM has already been agreed by RMC and could not be changed, leaving JBS with a disproportionate deficit in that year. The circumstances surrounding JBS' 2015-16 RAM deficit were noted by the Council of the School, along with Professor Loch's strong objection to the retrospective RAM TRAC Group decision.

Paper **T/17/30** details the School's savings strategy agreed during PR16 and proposes approaches for apportioning savings targets across departments in 2017-18. The Council of the School approved the following savings targets.

	<b>Total Savings</b>
	<b>£k</b>
ENG	328
CEB	67
COMP LAB	65
JBS	20
<b>TOTAL Chest</b>	<b>480</b>

It was also noted that Paper **T/17/31** demonstrates how School Strategic funds are utilised each year, and the consequent impact on annual allocations.

## **5. Straightforward Business**

### **5.1. Health and safety matters**

Departments did not report any Health and Safety matters to the Council of the School.

### **5.2. Risk Assessment**

The Council of the School was requested to assess the risks of the decisions made at this meeting and agreed no other risks needed to be added to the School's risk register.

## **6. \*\*\*Minutes of other committees**

Needs Committee	2 May 2017	<b>T/17/32</b>
Graduate School Committee	28 April 2017	<b>T/17/33</b>
IT Strategy Committee	2 May 2017	<b>T/17/34</b>

## **7. Dates of Future Meetings 2016-17 and 2017-18**

2.00 p.m. in Board Room (West Cambridge site), Department of Chemical Engineering and Biotechnology:  
Friday, 16 June 2017

2.00 p.m. in Board Room, Department of Engineering:  
Friday, 20 October 2017

2.00 p.m. in Room W2.01, Judge Business School:  
Friday, 24 November 2017

2.00 p.m. in Board Room, Department of Engineering:  
Friday, 02 February 2018

2.00 p.m. in Board Room (West Cambridge site), Department of Chemical Engineering and Biotechnology:  
Friday, 09 March 2018

2.00 p.m. in Board Room, Department of Engineering:  
Friday, 11 May 2018

2.00 p.m. in FW11, Computer Laboratory:  
Friday, 15 June 2018